

Minutes

Policy and Sustainability Committee

10.00 am, Tuesday 3 August 2021

Present

Councillors McVey (Convener), Day (Vice-Convener), Aldridge, Cameron (substituting for Councillor Wilson), Jim Campbell, Kate Campbell, Cook, Gloyer, Hutchison, Macinnes, McLellan, Main (substituting for Councillor Burgess), Miller, Mowat (substituting for Councillors McLellan (item 11) and Cook (items 12-17)), Munn, Perry, Frank Ross (substituting for Councillor Gardiner) and Whyte.

Also in attendance: Councillor Doggart (for Item 13)

1. Minutes

Decision

To approve the minute of the Policy and Sustainability Committee of 10 June 2021 as a correct record.

2. Policy and Sustainability Committee Work Programme

The Policy and Sustainability Committee Work Programme for 3 August 2021 was presented.

Decision

To note the Work Programme.

(Reference – Work Programme 3 August 2021, submitted.)

3. Policy and Sustainability Committee Rolling Actions Log

Details were provided of the outstanding actions arising from decisions taken by the Committee.

Decision

1) To agree to close the following actions:

Action 15 – Motion by Councillor Jim Campbell - Local Member Oversight

Action 18 – 2030 Climate Strategy – Draft for Consultation

Action 21 – Monitoring Officer Report

Action 21 – Youth Work in Community Centres and Other Locations

Action 22 – Edinburgh Integration Joint Board/Unlawful Discharges to Care Homes – Motions by Councillors Doggart and Howie

- 2) That a completion date be provided for Action 20 (Petition for Consideration – Resettle Refugees and Asylum Seekers from the Aegean Island Camps in Edinburgh).
- 3) To otherwise note the Rolling Actions Log.

(Reference – Rolling Actions Log, submitted.)

4. Business Bulletin

The Policy and Sustainability Committee Business Bulletin for 3 August 2021 was submitted.

Decision

To note the Business Bulletin.

(Reference – Business Bulletin 3 August, submitted.)

Declaration of Interests

Councillors Lesley Marion Cameron and Whyte declared a non-financial interest in the above item as Board members of EICC.

5. Adaptation and Renewal Programme Update

An update was provided on the Adaptation and Renewal Programme which covered decisions taken in period 4 June to 23 July 2021 and the latest Covid-19 Dashboard. Dona Milne from NHS Lothian provided an update on the Covid Vaccination Programme.

A presentation was also made on the Council's Empowered Learning Programme.

Decision

- 1) To note the Council's latest Covid-19 position following the statement from the First Minister on Tuesday, 27 July 2021 and associated Scottish Government guidance.
- 2) To note the Covid-19 Response Dashboard at Appendix 1 of the report by the Chief Executive.
- 3) To note the decisions taken to date under urgency provisions from 4 June to 23 July 2021 at Appendix 2 of the report.

- 4) To note the briefing paper on the Covid Vaccination programme from Dona Milne, Public Health Director for NHS Lothian at Appendix 3 of the report. This had previously been circulated to Policy and Sustainability members.
- 5) To note the working group progress updates from the Adaptation and Renewal Programme, including the ongoing support to hospitality and events as the sector reopened.
- 6) To request a briefing to all members of Council within one cycle which explained how the Council was involved in the vaccination programme and actions that elected members could take to help facilitate or encourage the uptake within their own communities.
- 7) To provide an update to members on voluntary groups who were providing assistance to members of the public with mobility difficulties with transport to vaccination centres.
- 8) To invite Dona Milne, NHS Lothian to a future meeting to provide an update on the vaccination programme (as part of the Adaptation and Renewal Programme Update).

(References – Policy and Sustainability Committee of 28 May 2020 (item 4); report by the Chief Executive, submitted.)

6. 2030 Climate Strategy - Consultation and Engagement Update

Details were provided on the Council's public consultation on the draft 2030 Climate Strategy which had been aligned with activity in the lead up to, and following on from, COP26. Engagement and consultation on the strategy were being centred around how the Council and the wider city could meaningfully act and support individual, community and organisational behavioural changes necessary to address climate change and support a just transition to net zero.

Dr Sam Gardner, Chair of the Climate Commission and Commission member Alex Hilliam presented an update on the Commission's activities over the past year and its priorities for 2021. They outlined the Commission's Climate Strategy Engagement Timeline and the top level feedback that had been received to the climate strategy.

Motion

- 1) To note the actions in the draft 2030 Climate Strategy reflected involvement and commitment from key city partners and that the consultation period was being used to broaden and deepen this commitment in the development of an implementation plan, and to understand the role city partners could play in supporting a just transition to net zero.
- 2) To note the early headline findings from the public consultation on the draft 2030 Climate Strategy and that a full report on consultation findings would be presented with the final strategy in October 2021.

- 3) To note the programme of events being delivered during the public consultation period, and that they would help gather intelligence to inform the Council's approach to a just transition within the final 2030 Climate Strategy and implementation plan.
- 4) To note the contribution the headline messages from the Climate Commission on the draft 2030 Climate Strategy and agree to address these within the final document.
- 5) To note that the Council would continue to work closely with the Climate Commission, taking account of the Commission's more detailed consultation response in the final 2030 Climate Strategy and implementation plan.

- moved by Councillor McVey, seconded by Councillor Day

Amendment

- 1) To note the actions in the draft 2030 Climate Strategy reflected involvement and commitment from key city partners and that the consultation period was being used to broaden and deepen this commitment in the development of an implementation plan, and to understand the role city partners could play in supporting a just transition to net zero.
- 2) To note the early headline findings from the public consultation on the draft 2030 Climate Strategy and that a full report on consultation findings would be presented with the final strategy in October 2021.
- 3) To note the apparent low profile of "adaption" in the consultation and observe that adaption would be a key part of any successful strategy to 2030 and beyond. Consider that references to addressing local flood risks, enhancing sea wall defences and allowing for the cooling of buildings, alongside other measures, might drive higher public participation as the direct benefit of such adaption would accrue to the residents of Edinburgh and would be required if predictions on the changes to climate that were already inevitable were correct.
- 4) To therefore agree to enhance these aspects in the remaining consultation period through all methods and with all audiences.
- 5) To note the programme of events being delivered during the public consultation period, and that they would help gather intelligence to inform the Council's approach to a just transition within the final 2030 Climate Strategy and implementation plan.
- 6) To note the contribution the headline messages from the Climate Commission on the draft 2030 Climate Strategy and agree to address these within the final document.

- 7) To note that the Council would continue to work closely with the Climate Commission, taking account of the Commission's more detailed consultation response in the final 2030 Climate Strategy and implementation plan.

- moved by Councillor Whyte, seconded by Councillor Jim Campbell

Voting

The voting was as follows:

For the motion	-	9 votes
For the amendment	-	7 votes

(For the motion: Lord Provost, Councillors Kate Campbell, Day, Macinnes, McVey, Main, Miller, Munn, Perry.

For the amendment: Councillors Aldridge, Jim Campbell, Cook, Gloyer, Hutchison, McLellan and Whyte.)

Decision

To approve the motion by Councillor McVey.

(References – Policy and Sustainability Committee of 10 June 2021 (item 1); report by the Executive Director of Corporate Services, submitted.)

7. Declaration on Food and Climate

The Leader of Glasgow City Council had written to all Scottish Council leaders asking them to formally sign the Declaration on Food and Climate which aimed to raise awareness of the importance of sustainable food systems to tackling both the climate and biodiversity emergencies, as well as helping to reduce poverty, inequality and poor health. It sought a commitment by local and regional governments to helping tackle the climate and biodiversity emergencies through renewing their commitment to sustainable food policies and joined up action and called on national governments to put food and farming at the heart of the global response to these emergencies.

Decision

- 1) To note the content of the Declaration on Food and Climate provided at Appendix 1 to the report by the Executive Director of Corporate Services.
- 2) To note that the declaration was in line with existing Council commitments on food and climate.
- 3) To agree that the Council now formally signs the Declaration on Food and Climate.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Corporate Services, submitted.)

8. Appointments to Working Groups 2021/2022

The Policy and Sustainability Committee was required to appoint the membership of its Working Groups for 2021/22. The proposed membership, structures and remits of each were detailed in Appendices 1 to 7 of the report by the Executive Director of Corporate Services.

The Committee were also asked to formally dissolve the Adaptation and Renewal All Party Oversight Group.

Motion

- 1) To agree to the re-appointment of members to Working Groups as set out in Appendices 1 to 7 of the report by the Executive Director of Corporate Services.
- 2) To agree to dissolve the Adaptation and Renewal All Party Oversight Group (Appendix 8 to the report).
- 3) To appoint Councillor Mitchell in place of Councillor Mowat on the Festival and Events All Party Oversight Group.
- 4) To note that there were two Liberal Democrat councillors listed in the membership of the Sustainability and Climate Emergency All Party Oversight Group and therefore to remove Councillor Aldridge from the membership.

- moved by Councillor McVey, seconded by Councillor Day

Amendment

- 1) To agree to the re-appointment of members to Working Groups as set out in Appendices 1 to 7 of the report by the Executive Director of Corporate Services with the following changes:
 - a) Replace Councillor Miller with Councillor Booth on the Edinburgh Waterfront All Party Oversight Group.
 - b) Replace Councillor Rae with Councillor Staniforth on the Equalities Working Group.
 - c) Replace Councillor Rae with Councillor Staniforth on the Festival and Events All Party Oversight Group.
 - d) Replace Councillor Miller with Councillor Booth on the West Edinburgh All Party Oversight Group.
- 2) To agree to dissolve the Adaptation and Renewal All Party Oversight Group (Appendix 8 to the report)

- moved by Councillor Miller, seconded by Councillor Main

In accordance with Standing Order 21(12), the amendment was accepted as an addendum to the motion.

Decision

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor McVey:

- 1) To agree to the re-appointment of members to Working Groups as set out in Appendices 1 to 7 of the report by the Executive Director of Corporate Services.
- 2) To agree to dissolve the Adaptation and Renewal All Party Oversight Group (Appendix 8 to the report).
- 3) To appoint Councillor Mitchell in place of Councillor Mowat on the Festival and Events All Party Oversight Group.
- 4) To note that there were two Liberal Democrat councillors listed in the membership of the Sustainability and Climate Emergency All Party Oversight Group and therefore to remove Councillor Aldridge from the membership.
- 5) To agree to the re-appointment of members to Working Groups as set out in Appendices 1 to 7 of the report by the Executive Director of Corporate Services with the following changes:
 - a) Replace Councillor Miller with Councillor Booth on the Edinburgh Waterfront All Party Oversight Group.
 - b) Replace Councillor Rae with Councillor Staniforth on the Equalities Working Group.
 - c) Replace Councillor Rae with Councillor Staniforth on the Festival and Events All Party Oversight Group.
 - d) Replace Councillor Miller with Councillor Booth on the West Edinburgh All Party Oversight Group.

(Reference – Policy and Sustainability Committee of 6 October 2020 (item 13) and 23 February 2021 (item 10); report by the Executive Director of Corporate Services, submitted.)

9. Update on Monitoring Officer Report

An update was provided on the Council's handling of a complex complaint which the SPSO had considered amounted to maladministration and sought for the Council to subsequently submit evidence to it that its recommendations had been implemented. The Council had submitted its evidence to the SPSO on 19 July 2021 who had confirmed its satisfaction with the evidence on 20 July 2021.

Decision

To note that all actions required to be undertaken by the Council in relation to a complex complaint had been evidenced to the satisfaction of the Scottish Public Services Ombudsman (the “SPSO”).

(References – Act of Council No 14 of 24 June 2021; report by the Legal and Assurance and Council Monitoring Officer, submitted.)

10. Seafield Sounding Board

An update was provided on the establishment of a Sounding Board to assist with engagement between the community, developers and Council representatives in relation to development proposals in the Seafield area. Agreement was also sought on the elected member representation at the Sounding Board..

Motion

To agree elected member representation on the Seafield Sounding Board as ward Councillors from Craigentinny/Duddingston ward, and the Convener and Vice Convener from the Housing, Homelessness and Fair Work Committee.

- moved by Councillor McVey, seconded by Councillor Day

Amendment

To agree elected member representation on the Seafield Sounding Board as ward Councillors from Craigentinny/Duddingston, Portobello/Craigmillar and Leith wards, and the Convener and Vice Convener from the Housing, Homelessness and Fair Work Committee.

- moved by Councillor Miller, seconded by Councillor Main

Voting

The voting was as follows:

For the motion	-	15 votes
For the amendment	-	2 votes

(For the motion: Lord Provost, Councillors Aldridge, Cameron, Jim Campbell, Kate Campbell, Cook, Day, Gloyer, Hutchison, Macinnes, McLellan, McVey, Munn, Perry and Whyte.

For the amendment: Councillors Main and Miller.)

Decision

To approve the motion by Councillor McVey.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted.)

11. Scottish Government Consultation – New Year's Day Trading

An overview of the Scottish Government consultation on a legislative closure of large retail premises on New Year's Day (1 January) was provided which included a proposed response from the Council to this consultation.

Motion

- 1) To note the ongoing Scottish Government consultation on whether to extend the prohibition on large retailers in Scotland to close on Christmas Day to also apply on New Year's Day.
- 2) To acknowledge the hard work and efforts of shop/retail workers during the busy Festive periods including Boxing Day. To recognise the ambition of the city to embed fair work in our economic strategy, and to make Edinburgh a Living Wage City.
- 3) To approve the response to the consultation with the following changes:
 - a) To agree to add in Answer 1 that Council echoes trade union requests that employee working conditions be enhanced if large stores remain open but that closing larger retailers for New Year's Day would best protect conditions.
 - b) To replace the third paragraph in Answer 2 to read:

“In terms of social impact, there is no doubt that retail workers have been impacted incredibly hard over the last 18 months and that there is a large amount of stress for anyone in the sector in December. Retail workers should be entitled to quality time off, just like any worker in other sectors. It is worth highlighting that the representative voices of workers who would be affected, their trade union Usdaw and the STUC, are clear that the Scottish Government using their powers and closing large shops on New Year's Day would be beneficial for retail workers. This is based on evidence provided to them directly by their members including a headline figure of 99% of workers agreeing that large stores should close.

- moved by Councillor McVey, seconded by Councillor Day

Amendment

- 1) To note the ongoing Scottish Government consultation on whether to extend the prohibition on large retailers in Scotland to close on Christmas Day to also apply on New Year's Day.

- 2) To amend the response to Q 1 in the draft response (Appendix 2 of the report by the Executive Director of Place), as follows:

"City of Edinburgh Council (the Council) can see how introducing such legislation could have some benefits, and while supporting any decision made by Parliament, the many downsides outweigh the benefits and the closure of large retailers on New Year's Day is not supported in principle.

"Local authorities are not under a statutory duty to enforce the Act and the Council's small Regulatory Services team currently can only deal with emergencies on New Year's Day. The proposed New Year's Day closure would require some enforcement at least initially, but there would be no scope for the team to proactively police the new regulations.

"However, should trading on New Year's Day not be banned, it is imperative that legislation is introduced to protect working conditions and staff welfare, ensuring that workers are properly rewarded for public holiday working and any additional sacrifices this may entail."

- 3) To amend the final sentence in the first paragraph of the response to Q2 in the draft response as follows:

"They may consequentially well decide not to trade on New Year's Day either, and although this would enable more people to have time off work, it would also deny the opportunity to work for those who wished to do so. It could also mean less things to do for those not working."

- 4) To delete the final paragraph of the Q2 response (covered above).

- 5) To amend the final sentence of the response to Q4 in the draft response as follows:

"In addition, Edinburgh as a city is well known for the Hogmanay celebrations which attract an audience of thousands of people from all around the world, often seeing the New Year's Day shopping as part of their Edinburgh experience. As it could take some time for the City Centre economy to recover from Covid, it would be unwise at present to support restrictions which could hamper its revival."

- moved by Councillor Whyte, seconded by Councillor Cook

Voting

The voting was as follows:

For the motion	-	10 votes
For the amendment	-	7 votes

(For the motion: Lord Provost, Councillors Cameron, Kate Campbell, Day, Macinnes, McVey, Main, Miller, Munn and Perry.

For the amendment: Councillors Aldridge, Jim Campbell, Cook, Gloyer, Hutchison, Mowat, and Whyte.)

Decision

To approve the motion by Councillor McVey.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted.)

Declaration of Interests

Councillor McLellan declared a financial interest as he had made a submission on behalf of the Scottish Newspaper Society and left the meeting during the Committee's consideration of the above item.

12. Edinburgh Integration Joint Board Progress Report

An update was provided on the work of the Edinburgh Integrated Joint Board (EIJB) and delivery of its strategic plan for the period January to June 2021.

Decision

- 1) To note the report by the Chief Officer, Edinburgh Health and Social Care Partnership.
- 2) To provide details of progress in transitioning to the 3 Conversations model to members, including milestones and completion dates.

(Reference – report by the Chief Officer, Edinburgh Health and Social Care Partnership, submitted.)

13. Edinburgh Response to the Mental Welfare Commissions Report – Authority to Discharge

In response to motions by Councillors Doggart and Howie details were provided on the number, under each category included in the Mental Welfare Commission's Report – Authority to Discharge, of a summary of the authorities to discharge for all patients since the start of the pandemic together with confirmation that all relevant Edinburgh Health and Social Care Partnership staff had received training in respect of current

policies and procedures, and realistic and achievable timescales to carry out a proportionate and robust review of all cases over the past 16 months setting out current resource requirements in continuing to deal with the pandemic to inform that timeline.

Motion

- 1) To note the response from the Chief Officer of the Edinburgh Integration Joint Board and the Chief Social Work Officer for Edinburgh to the findings and improvements recommended by the Mental Welfare Commission's report – Authority to Discharge.
- 2) To note the detail, including numbers and timescales, for the completion of an additional audit of Edinburgh cases to ensure a rigorous improvement plan for the city
- 3) To note that the audit referenced at paragraph 5.4 of the report by the Chief Officer, Edinburgh Health and Social Care Partnership would report back to Committee upon completion.
- 4) To agree that an update be provided to Committee on the implementation of the Mental Welfare Commission's recommendations.

- moved by Councillor McVey, seconded by Councillor Day

Amendment

- 1) To note the response from the Chief Officer of the Edinburgh Integration Joint Board and the Chief Social Work Officer for Edinburgh to the findings and improvements recommended by the Mental Welfare Commission's report – Authority to Discharge.
- 2) To note that the terms of the motion agreed at Council were not fulfilled by the information in the report by the Chief Officer, Edinburgh Health and Social Care Partnership and request a further report to the Policy and Sustainability Committee in one cycle as per the points below
- 3) To request the information required in the Council motion at 2.4.1, i.e. the number, under each category included in the MWCS report, as a summary of the authorities to discharge for all patients since the start of the pandemic. For clarification covering from the 20th March 2020 to date.
- 4) To note that the Chief Officer had been unable to provide confirmation that all relevant staff had received the appropriate training, and therefore to request detail of the training needs analysis, breaking down the total numbers of relevant staff and their related requirements and completion dates for training.
- 5) To note that the report suggested only an audit of a small number of cases covering a short period was carried out, and to request a report in one cycle to

fulfil the original motion request 2.4.3. 'Realistic and achievable timescales to carry out a proportionate review of all cases over the past 16 months...'

- moved by Councillor Main, seconded by Councillor Miller

In accordance with Standing Order 21(12), paragraph 5 of the amendment was accepted as an addendum to the motion.

Decision

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor McVey:

- 1) To note the response from the Chief Officer of the Edinburgh Integration Joint Board and the Chief Social Work Officer for Edinburgh to the findings and improvements recommended by the Mental Welfare Commission's report – Authority to Discharge.
- 2) To note the detail, including numbers and timescales, for the completion of an additional audit of Edinburgh cases to ensure a rigorous improvement plan for the city
- 3) To note that the audit referenced at paragraph 5.4 of the report by the Chief Officer, Edinburgh Health and Social Care Partnership would report back to Committee upon completion.
- 4) To agree that an update be provided to Committee on the implementation of the Mental Welfare Commission's recommendations.
- 5) To note that the report suggested only an audit of a small number of cases covering a short period was carried out, and to request a report in one cycle to fulfil the original motion request 2.4.3 'Realistic and achievable timescales to carry out a proportionate review of all cases over the past 16 months....'

(Reference – report by the Chief Officer, Edinburgh Health and Social Care Partnership, submitted.)

14. Social Care Charging Policy

Details were provided on a proposed updated Social Care Charging Policy which had been developed in consultation with the social care transactions team and the finance team.

Decision

To agree the Social Care Charging Policy.

(Reference – report by the Chief Officer, Edinburgh Health and Social Care Partnership, submitted.)

15. Youth Work in Community Centres and Other Locations

The Council had requested an update report to Policy and Sustainability Committee with information of the programme of reopening youth services that took place in the summer as well as further actions planned upon school return.

Details were provided on Council sponsored youth work services which had been provided throughout the summer of 2021 in a range of settings and the Youth work provision which had been a key feature of the successful Get into Summer Programme. Work was continuing with Management Committees of Community Centres to support the resumption of Youth Work in Community Centres as part of the Council approved phased approach to re-opening of Community Centres and Council officers were working with Lothian Association of Youth Clubs (LAYC) to collate a city wide response to a request for information on plans for Youth Work provision and plans for Sept 2021 and beyond.

Motion

- 1) To note the achievements and the success of the Get into Summer Programme.
- 2) To note the delivery of youth work in centres and other locations.
- 3) To note that plans were in place for the resumption of youth work services in a range of settings across the city from September 2021.
- 4) To note that City of Edinburgh Council officers were working with Lothian Association of Youth Clubs (LAYC) to gather information from Youth Work providers to establish if there are issues relating to access to Council buildings and Council officers would work to resolve any difficulties.
- 5) To agree to receive a further report on the youth work strategy in October.

- moved by Councillor McVey, seconded by Councillor Day

Amendment

- 1) To note the programme to open community centres.
- 2) To note that there had been some confusion and conflicting views on the status of the programme.
- 3) To agree that a briefing for ward councillors would be included as part of the process to open each community centre.
- 4) To call for the “Adaptation and Renewal Programme Update – Community Centres” report scheduled for the next meeting of this committee to update the status and the progress for all community centres, detailing any issues or problems arising and actions being taken.

- moved by Councillor Miller, seconded by Councillor Main

In accordance with Standing Order 21(12), the amendment was accepted as an addendum to the motion.

Decision

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor McVey:

- 1) To note the achievements and the success of the Get into Summer Programme.
- 2) To note the delivery of youth work in centres and other locations.
- 3) To note that plans were in place for the resumption of youth work services in a range of settings across the city from September 2021.
- 4) To note that City of Edinburgh Council officers were working with Lothian Association of Youth Clubs (LAYC) to gather information from Youth Work providers to establish if there are issues relating to access to Council buildings and Council officers would work to resolve any difficulties.
- 5) To agree to receive a further report on the youth work strategy in October.
- 6) To note the programme to open community centres.
- 7) To note that there had been some confusion and conflicting views on the status of the programme.
- 8) To agree that a briefing for ward councillors would be included as part of the process to open each community centre.
- 9) To call for the “Adaptation and Renewal Programme Update – Community Centres” report scheduled for the next meeting of this committee to update the status and the progress for all community centres, detailing any issues or problems arising and actions being taken.

(References – Act of Council No 12 of 24 June 2021; report by the Interim Executive Director of Education and Children’s Services, submitted.)

16. Internal Audit Overdue Findings and Key Performance Indicators as at 27 April 2021 – referral from the Governance, Risk and Best Value Committee

The Governance, Risk and Best Value Committee had referred a report on Internal Audit Overdue Findings and Key Performance Indicators as at 27 April 2021, which provided an overview of the status of the overdue Internal Audit (IA) findings as at 27 April 2021 to the Policy and Sustainability Committee for information.

Decision

To note the report by the Governance, Risk and Best Value Committee.

(Reference – Governance, Risk and Best Value Committee, 8 June 2021 (item 5); referral from the Governance, Risk and Best Value Committee, submitted.)

Declaration of Interests

Councillor Macinnes declared a non-financial interest in the above item as Chair of Transport for Edinburgh.

17. Ventilation – Motion by Councillor Jim Campbell

The following motion by Councillor Jim Campbell was submitted in terms of Standing Order 17:

- 1) Committee recognises that most people spend more time indoors than outdoors and acknowledges the emerging literature on the significantly elevated risks of airborne transmission of COVID 19 within poorly ventilated indoor spaces, most recently outlined in the report by Prof Peter Guthrie commissioned by Sir Patrick Vallance, The UK Government's Chief Scientific Adviser.
- 2) Committee notes:
 - that governments around the world are urgently investigating indoor air quality within buildings to better understand any emerging risks;
 - that poorly ventilated School Buildings are a particular cause of concern, and evidence suggests they can negatively impact the development of children;
 - that few standards exist around indoor air quality, and it is not a subject that is widely understood in the context of today's buildings, despite being a design principle in Victorian times;
 - that inexpensive monitoring of carbon dioxide levels within a building are a very good proxy of overall indoor air quality and could be rapidly deployed in the City of Edinburgh estate.
- 3) Committee commends Council Officers for having distributed carbon dioxide sensors to Head Teachers and requests the Chief Executive to prepare an urgent report for this Committee in one cycle on indoor air quality across the most heavily used buildings in the Council estate. This should include the data gathered by Head Teachers with an accompanying commentary covering the methodology used and observations so far.

- 4) Finally, the Chief Executive is asked to indicate a level of carbon dioxide concentration in high use indoor Council settings above which Members should be concerned that an unreasonable risk of Coronavirus transmission exists. “

Motion

- 1) Committee recognises that most people spend more time indoors than outdoors and acknowledges the emerging literature on the significantly elevated risks of airborne transmission of COVID 19 within poorly ventilated indoor spaces, most recently outlined in the report by Prof Peter Guthrie commissioned by Sir Patrick Vallance, The UK Government's Chief Scientific Adviser.
- 2) Committee notes:
- that governments around the world are urgently investigating indoor air quality within buildings to better understand any emerging risks;
 - that poorly ventilated School Buildings are a particular cause of concern, and evidence suggests they can negatively impact the development of children;
 - that few standards exist around indoor air quality, and it is not a subject that is widely understood in the context of today's buildings, despite being a design principle in Victorian times;
 - that inexpensive monitoring of carbon dioxide levels within a building are a very good proxy of overall indoor air quality and could be rapidly deployed in the City of Edinburgh estate.
- 3) Finally, to ask the Chief Executive to indicate an acceptable range of carbon dioxide concentration, in line with the announcement of the Scotland's First Minister on 3 August 2021, to minimise risks of SARS-CoV-2 transmission in high use indoor Council settings.

- moved by Councillor Jim Campbell, seconded by Councillor McLellan

Amendment.

To amend points 3 and 4 of the motion by Councillor Jim Campbell as originally submitted to read:

- 3) To commend council officers for having distributed carbon dioxide sensors to head teachers and request the Chief Executive prepare an update for this committee in one cycle on indoor air quality across the most heavily used buildings in the council estate. This should include data which has been recorded with an accompanying commentary covering the methodology used and observations so far.

- 4) Finally, to ask the Chief Executive to indicate if advice or guidance had been provided to the council on a level of carbon dioxide concentration in high use indoor council settings above which members should be concerned that an unreasonable risk of SARS-CoV-2 transmission existed.

- moved by Councillor Miller, seconded by Councillor Main

In accordance with Standing Order 21(12), point 3 of the amendment was accepted as an addendum to the motion.

Decision

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Jim Campbell:

- 1) To recognise that most people spend more time indoors than outdoors and acknowledge the emerging literature on the significantly elevated risks of airborne transmission of COVID 19 within poorly ventilated indoor spaces, most recently outlined in the report by Prof Peter Guthrie commissioned by Sir Patrick Vallance, The UK Government's Chief Scientific Adviser.
- 2) To note:
 - that governments around the world were urgently investigating indoor air quality within buildings to better understand any emerging risks;
 - that poorly ventilated School Buildings were a particular cause of concern, and evidence suggested they could negatively impact the development of children;
 - that few standards existed around indoor air quality, and it was not a subject that was widely understood in the context of today's buildings, despite being a design principle in Victorian times;
 - that inexpensive monitoring of carbon dioxide levels within a building were a very good proxy of overall indoor air quality and could be rapidly deployed in the City of Edinburgh estate.
- 3) To commend council officers for having distributed carbon dioxide sensors to head teachers and request the Chief Executive prepare an update for this committee in one cycle on indoor air quality across the most heavily used buildings in the council estate. This should include data which has been recorded with an accompanying commentary covering the methodology used and observations so far.
- 4) Finally, to ask the Chief Executive to indicate an acceptable range of carbon dioxide concentration, in line with the announcement of the Scotland's First Minister on 3 August 2021, to minimise risks of SARS-CoV-2 transmission in high use indoor Council settings.